

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

FRIDAY, JANUARY 28, 2011

PRESENT: **NANCY CARTMILL, COMMISSIONER**
ROBERT L. BAILEY, COMMISSIONER
ANNE YON, COMMISSIONER
RHONDA MANTENEZ, PURCHASING ASSISTANT

Nancy Cartmill, Commissioner, called the Board of Equalization and Review to order at 10:00 a.m.

APPEARING: **MARY WAYBRIGHT, CHIEF DEPUTY FOR THE**
ASSESSOR'S OFFICE

Mary Waybright, Chief Deputy, stated the Assessor's Real, Personal and Business Property Books were available for the Board to review, if needed.

APPROVE: **CORRECTIONS OF APPRAISAL OR ASSESSMENT ON**
REAL, PERSONAL AND BUSINESS PROPERTY

Robert L. Bailey, Commissioner, **moved to approve the corrections of appraisal or assessments on real, personal and business property, as provided by the Assessor.** Anne Yon, Commissioner, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous. **Exhibit (A)**

10:00 A.M. **RICHARD GARDNER, APPEARING**

2094 MILLER ROAD, HUNTINGTON, WV.

DISTRICT – KYLE, MAP – 81, PARCEL – 0023

2010 APPRAISED VALUE - \$135,300

2011 APPRAISED VALUE - \$135,300

VALUE IN MR. GARDNER'S OPINION - \$95,000

Mr. Gardner presented documentation to the Board regarding property on Miller Road. Mr. Gardner stated his taxes were higher than all of the property owners except for one and his house was the smallest house on Miller Road. Mr. Gardner went on to say he did not understand why his taxes would be so high as the market was down.

J.P. Adkins, Assessor's office, stated that the market had not changed even though sales were down, but the values had not decreased in this area. Mr. Adkins further stated that because one side of Miller Road was in the city and the other side was in the county, also made a difference in the property owner's taxes.

Nancy Cartmill, President, informed Mr. Gardner that he would be notified by mail of the Board's decision.

Robert L. Bailey, Commissioner, **moved to approve lowering the appraised value from \$135,300.00 to \$100,000.00 for the property of Richard Gardner, located at 2094 Miller Road, Huntington, Kyle District, Map 81 and Parcel 0023.** Anne Yon, Commissioner, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

FRIDAY, JANUARY 28, 2011

PAGE TWO

Nancy Cartmill, President, recessed the meeting at 10:35 a.m., until Monday, January 31, 2011, at 10:00 a.m.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

MONDAY, JANUARY 31, 2011

PRESENT: ROBERT L. BAILEY, PRESIDENT PRO-TEM
ANNE YON, COMMISSIONER
RHONDA MONTANEZ, PURCHASING ASSISTANT

ABSENT: NANCY CARTMILL, PRESIDENT

Robert L. Bailey, President Pro-Tem, reconvened the Board of Equalization and Review at 10:00 a.m.

APPROVE: CORRECTION OF APPRAISAL OR ASSESSMENT ON
REAL, PERSONAL AND BUSINESS PROPERTY

Anne Yon, Commissioner, **moved to approve the corrections of appraisal or assessments on real, personal and business property, as provided by the Assessor.** Robert L. Bailey, President Pro-Tem, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous. **Exhibit (B)**

10:00 A.M. NINA (ENSOR) OVERBY, APPEARING
811 JEFFERSON AVENUE, HUNTINGTON
DISTRICT – KYLE, MAP – 42, PARCEL – 0068

2010 APPRAISED VALUE - \$61,700

2011 APPRAISED VALUE - \$61,700

VALUE IN MS. ENSOR OVERBY'S OPINION - \$110,000

Mrs. Overby stated she made a mistake when she valued her property for \$110,000.00. Mrs. Overby went on to say she was not unhappy with the appraised value, only the amount of taxes she had to pay on the property. Mrs. Overby further stated that her son lived on the property rent free and the house needed to be renovated. Mrs. Overby provided documentation on the property around her house for the Board to review.

J.D. Adkins, Assessor's office, provided the Board with the amount of sales in the area and stated he believed the appraised amount was correct. Mr. Adkins went on to say that the higher tax rate was because the house was considered to be rental property. Mr. Adkins stated they had discussed a Life Estate with Mrs. Overby, however, she had indicated she was not comfortable with this option.

Robert L. Bailey, President Pro-Tem, informed Mrs. Overby that the Board could only take under consideration the appraised value not the amount of taxes paid and she would be notified by mail of the Board's decision.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

MONDAY, JANUARY 31, 2011

PAGE THREE

Robert L. Bailey, President Pro-Tem, **moved to approve lowering the appraised value from \$61,700 to \$58,000 for the property of Nina Overby located at 811 Jefferson Avenue, Huntington, Kyle District, Map 42 and Parcel 0068.** Anne Yon, Commissioner, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous.

Robert L. Bailey, President Pro-Tem, recessed the meeting at 10:20 a.m., until Thursday, February 3, 2011, at 1:00 p.m.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 3, 2011

PRESENT: **NANCY CARTMILL, PRESIDENT**
ROBERT L. BAILEY, COMMISSIONER
ANNE YON, COMMISSIONER
RHONDA MONTANEZ, PURCHASING ASSISTANT

Nancy Cartmill, President, reconvened the Board of Equalization and Review at 1:00 p.m.

APPROVE: **CORRECTIONS OF APPRAISAL OR ASSESSMENT ON**
REAL, PERSONAL AND BUSINESS PROPERTY

Anne Yon, Commissioner, **moved to approve the corrections of appraisal or assessments on real, personal and business property, as provided by the Assessor.** Robert L. Bailey, Commissioner, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous. **Exhibit (C)**

1:00 P.M. **GEORGE A. MORRIS, APPEARING**
1623 HARVEY ROAD, HUNTINGTON
DISTRICT – 06, MAP – 67, PARCEL – 67.4
2010 APPRAISED VALUE - \$N/A
2011 APPRAISED VALUE - \$12,100

VALUE IN MR. MORRIS'S OPINION - \$6,000

Mr. Morris stated that he believed the appraised value was too high on his property due to there being no buildings on the property and the property belonged in the flood plain. Mr. Morris further stated he had paid \$15,000 for the property because it was next to his house and he had paid too much.

J.D. Adkins, Assessor's office, stated that the appraised value of Mr. Morris's land was consistent with the surrounding properties. Mr. Adkins went on to say that even though the property was in the flood plain, it did still have a value.

Nancy Cartmill, President, informed Mr. Morris he would be notified by mail of the Board's decision.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 3, 2011

PAGE FOUR

Anne Yon, Commissioner, **moved to approve leaving the 2011 appraised value of \$12,100 for the property of George A. Morris, located at 1623 Harvey Road, Huntington, District 06, Map 67 and Parcel 67.4.** Nancy Cartmill, President, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous.

1:15 P.M. TERESA SMOOT - CANCELLED

Nancy Cartmill, President, recessed the meeting at 1:20 p.m., until Monday, February 7, 2011, at 10:00 a.m.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

MONDAY, FEBRUARY 7, 2011

PRESENT: ROBERT L. BAILEY, COMMISSIONER
RHONDA MONTANEZ, PURCHASING ASSISTANT

ABSENT: ANNE YON, COMMISSIONER

NANCY CARTMILL, PRESIDENT
(PRESIDENT CARTMILL TELECONFERENCED INTO
THE MEETING)

Nancy Cartmill, President, reconvened the Board of Equalization and Review at 10:00 a.m.

APPROVE: CORRECTIONS OF APPRAISAL OR ASSESSMENT ON
REAL, PERSONAL AND BUSINESS PROPERTY

Robert L. Bailey, Commissioner, **moved to approve the corrections of appraisal or assessments on real, personal and business property, as provided by the Assessor.** Nancy Cartmill, President, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous. **Exhibit (D)**

10:00 A.M. NO APPOINTMENTS FOR FEBRUARY 7, 2011

Nancy Cartmill, President, recessed the meeting at 10:02 a.m., until Friday, February 11, 2011 at 10:00 a.m.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

FRIDAY, FEBRUARY 11, 2011

PRESENT: **NANCY CARTMILL, PRESIDENT**
ROBERT L. BAILEY, COMMISSIONER
ANNE YON, COMMISSIONER
RHONDA MONTANEZ, PURCHASING ASSISTANT

Nancy Cartmill, President, reconvened the Board of Equalization and Review at 10:00 a.m.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

FRIDAY, FEBRUARY 11, 2011

PAGE FIVE

APPROVE: **CORRECTIONS OF APPRAISAL OR ASSESSMENT ON**
REAL, PERSONAL AND BUSINESS PROPERTY

Robert L. Bailey, Commissioner, **moved to approve the corrections of appraisal or assessments on real, personal and business property, as provided by the Assessor.** Anne Yon, Commissioner, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous. **Exhibit (E)**

10:00 A.M. APPOINTMENT MOVED TO 11:15 A.M.

10:00 A.M.

CARTER J. SMITH, JR., APPEARING

RT 3, BOX 152, MILTON

DISTRICT – GRANT, MAP - 1, PARCEL – 8.5

2010 APPRAISED VALUE - \$55,200

2011 APPRAISED VALUE - \$54,000

VALUE IN MR. SMITH’S OPINION - \$28,000 TO \$30,000

(BOE LOWERED TO \$35,000 IN 2010)

Mr. Smith stated he believed the appraised value on his property was too high and he did not understand why the appraised value was higher than last year. Mr. Smith further stated his property was out in the county, not in the Town of Milton.

Nancy Cartmill, President, informed Mr. Smith that when the Board of Equalization and Review lowered the appraised value on his property in 2010, it was only good for one year.

Brent Williams, Assessor’s Office, showed examples of the sale of property in the Milton area and informed the Board he had taken into consideration the location of Mr. Smith’s store.

Nancy Cartmill, President, informed Mr. Smith that he would be notified by mail of the Board’s decision.

Robert L. Bailey, Commission, **moved to approve lowering the appraised value from \$54,000 to \$35,000 for Carter J. Smith, Jr.** Motion died for lack of a second.

Anne Yon, Commissioner, **moved to approve lowering the appraised value from \$54,000 to \$50,000 for the property of Carter J. Smith, Jr., located at Rt. 3, Box 152, Milton, Grant District, Map 1 and Parcel 8.5.** Nancy Cartmill, President, seconded the motion and the vote was as follows:

Nancy Cartmill, President aye
Robert L. Bailey, Commissioner nay
Anne Yon, Commissioner aye

10:30 A.M. STEVE ZICKAFOOSE – CANCELLED

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

FRIDAY, FEBRUARY 11, 2011

PAGE SIX

Nancy Cartmill, President, recessed the Board of Equalization and Review at 10:25 a.m.

Nancy Cartmill, President, reconvened the Board of Equalization and Review at 11:00 a.m., with Robert L. Bailey, Commissioner, absent.

**11:00 A.M. PATRICK PRICE, APPEARING
DUCHARME, MCMILLEN &
ASSOCIATES, INC.**

APPEARING FOR:

BPS PRINTING SYSTEMS LLC/FLINT GROUP

**NOTE: THE STATE TAX DEPARTMENT WILL BE PRESENT FOR THIS
HEARING TO DEFEND THEIR VALUE**

Patrick Price, DuCharme, McMillen & Associates, provided documentation for the Board to review. Mr. Price stated that the five properties should be considered as one economic unit because he did believe they could be sold separately. Mr. Price went on to say that the price of \$14.00 per square foot was not feasible with the declining value for commercial property.

Mr. Price provided market data of sales transactions and data on the listing of property that had not sold. Mr. Price stated that BPS Printing Systems LLC/Flint Group were requesting no increase for 2011 and would be happy with the 2010 appraised value.

William Watson, County Attorney, swore in Faith Dangerfield, State Tax Department Chief Appraisal and Mr. Patrick Price to allow testimony to be taken.

Tim Wagoner, State Tax Attorney, asked Ms. Dangerfield what approach could be used for an appraisal. Ms. Dangerfield stated there were three different approaches that could be used, which were the income approach, market approach and the cost approach. Ms. Dangerfield stated the cost approach was used in appraising the value for BPS Printing Systems.

Mr. Wagoner asked Ms. Dangerfield the price of footage regarding the property, to which she stated it was \$10.56 per square foot. Mr. Wagoner requested Exhibit #1 be placed on record regarding the square footage.

Ms. Dangerfield stated she believed the appraised value for the property was correct as the property had great access, market value and was near the railroad.

Nancy Cartmill, President, informed Mr. Price he would be notified by mail of the Board's decision.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

FRIDAY, FEBRUARY 11, 2011

PAGE SEVEN

11:15 A.M. STEVEN R. BROADWATER, APPEARING FOR
PARKVIEW LIMITED PARTNERSHIP
THE HAMLETS LIMITED PARTNERSHIP
PINE HAVEN LIMITED PARTNERSHIP

Mr. Broadwater, Attorney representing Housing Corporation, requested that William Watson, County Attorney, swear in David Bunch, Certified Appraiser.

Mr. Broadwater asked Mr. Bunch to explain the appraisement on the three properties and how the appraisements were conducted. Mr. Bunch gave an explanation of this process.

Mr. Broadwater asked that the appraisements be made Exhibits:

The Parks Exhibit #1

The ParksExhibits-2A-2B-2C-2D-2E-2F

The Hamlets Exhibit #3

The Hamlets Exhibits-4A-4B-4C-4D-4E

Pine Haven Exhibit #5

Pine Haven Exhibits-6A-6B-6C-6D-6E-6F

Mr. Broadwater requested that the next exhibits, which were common to all the properties, be entered into the record:

All Properties Exhibit #7

Exhibits 7A-7B-7C-7D

Larry Ellis, Vice President of Housing Development Corporation, appeared before the Board and was sworn in by William Watson, County Attorney.

Mr. Ellis presented tax tickets he believed to be comparable to the three properties in Cabell County. Mr. Broadwater requested that these tax tickets be made a part of the record:

Wayne County Tax Ticket-Exhibit #8

Cabell County Tax Ticket-Exhibit #9

Wayne County Tax Ticket-Exhibit #10

John Perry, Cabell County Assessor's Office Chief Appraiser, was sworn in by William Watson, County Attorney.

Stephen Sluss, Attorney for the Cabell County Assessor, asked Mr. Perry what approach he used to set the appraised value for the three properties. Mr. Perry stated he used the cost approach, approved by the State of West Virginia, along with replacement cost/new and less depreciation, plus land. Mr. Perry went on to say every piece of property in West Virginia was appraised by that process and that was what generated the tax tickets.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

FRIDAY, FEBRUARY 11, 2011

PAGE EIGHT

Mr. Sluss asked Mr. Perry about a new offer the Assessor had made to the property owner.

Mr. Perry explained that after the tax tickets were mailed for 2011, Judge Pancake issued an order that the Assessor use the income approach to obtain economical obsolescence for the properties in question. Mr. Perry stated that the Assessor was willing to arrive at a lower value, to comply with the Judge's order, in hopes that a court case would be avoided. Mr. Perry informed the Board that by using the income approach ordered by the Judge, the 2011 appraised value on Parkview of \$2,773,800 was lowered to \$1,500,000; the 2011 appraised value of The Hamlets of \$2,836,700 was lowered to \$1,750,000 and the 2011 appraised value of Pine Haven of \$1,889,800 was lowered to \$950,000.

Mr. Sluss asked that the Exhibits be place on record:

Reconciliation Statement-Exhibit #1

Cap Rate-Exhibit #2

Income Expense Statement for 3 years/The Hamlets-Exhibit #3

Income Expense Statement for 3 Years/Parkview-Exhibit #4

Income Expense Statement for 3 Years/Pine Haven-Exhibit #5

William Watson, County Attorney, asked Mr. Perry if it was the Assessor's intention to reduce the three properties and to have the valuations of the three properties remain the same every year.

Mr. Perry stated that the reduced offer to the tax payer would remain the same every year, unless there was new legislation or new guidelines from the State Tax Department.

Mr. Broadwater requested a recess.

Nancy Cartmill, President, recessed the meeting at 12:50 p.m.

Nancy Cartmill, President, reconvened the meeting at 1:05 p.m.

Mr. Broadwater discussed several issues regarding the cost approach and the income approach with Mr. Perry and asked Mr. Perry if had had used obsolescence in his appraisal, as Mr. Bunch had done in his appraisals. Mr. Perry stated that the Assessor's office did not feel there was obsolescence in the three properties, as they were fairly new.

Mr. Broadwater stated he believed the cost approach was not properly performed and requested that the Board not act on this matter today in hopes both parties could work out this matter.

Nancy Cartmill, President, informed Mr. Broadwater that he would be notified by mail of the Board's decision.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

FRIDAY, FEBRUARY 11, 2011

PAGE NINE

VICTORY PLACE, LLC

DISTRICT – 01, MAP – 8J, PARCEL – 294.1

2010 APPRAISED VALUE - \$2,872,600

2011 APPRAISED VALUE - \$2,697,100

**(PER JUDGE PANCAKE'S COURT ORDER;
\$1,450,000 FOR 2010)**

This was settled by the Assessor's Office.

Nancy Cartmill, President, recessed the meeting at 1:20 p.m., until Tuesday, February 15, 2011 at 10:00 a.m.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

TUESDAY, FEBRUARY 15, 2011

PRESENT: NANCY CARTMILL, PRESIDENT
ROBERT L. BAILEY, COMMISSIONER
ANNE YON, COMMISSIONER
RHONDA MONTANEZ, PURCHASING ASSISTANT

Nancy Cartmill, President, reconvened the Board of Equalization and Review at 10:00 a.m.

APPROVE: CORRECTIONS OF APPRAISAL OR ASSESSMENTS ON
REAL, PERSONAL AND BUSINESS PROPERTY

Robert L. Bailey, Commissioner, **moved to approve the corrections of appraisal or assessments on real, personal and business property, as presented by the Assessor.** Anne Yon, Commissioner, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous. **Exhibit (F)**

10:15 A.M. JERRY EPLING, APPEARING
RESOLVED BY STATE TAX DEPARTMENT

10:30 A.M. GREG & CYNTHIA BLAKE, APPEARING
608 PEYTON STREET, BARBOURSVILLE
DISTRICT – 2, MAP – 7, PARCEL – 210.1
2010 APPRAISED VALUE - \$10,700 (VACANT LAND)
2011 APPRAISED VALUE - \$124,500
VALUE IN GREG & CYNTHIA BLAKE’S OPINION - \$110,000

Mr. Blake stated he believed his appraised value too high because his lot was very narrow and he had very little yard. Mr. Blake further stated that he had built the house himself at a cost of \$82,000.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

TUESDAY, FEBRUARY 15, 2011

PAGE TEN

John Perry, Assessor’s Office, stated that Mr. Blake’s house was valued at the current market value. Mr. Perry provided documentation regarding sales in the Barboursville area.

Mr. Perry stated that Mr. Blake had \$150,000 insurance on his house.

Nancy Cartmill, President, informed Mr. Blake he would be notified by mail of the Board's decision.

Anne Yon, Commissioner, **moved to approve leaving the 2011 appraised value at \$124,500 for the property of Greg & Cynthia Blake, located at 608 Peyton Street, Barboursville, District 2, Map 7 and Parcel 210.1.** Nancy Cartmill, Commissioner, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous.

10:45 A.M. BILL TURNER CANCELLED (PER AGREEMENT)

The Board of Equalization and Review made decisions for the following properties from the previous meeting of Friday, February 11, 2011.

Robert L. Bailey, Commissioner, stated he would not be able to vote on the following properties because he had not attended the meeting when the properties were discussed.

BPS PRINTING SYSTEMS LLC/FLINT GROUP

2400 5TH AVENUE, HUNTINGTON:

DISTRICT - 05, MAP – 20, PARCEL – 98.1

2010 APPRAISED VALUE - \$3,476,000

2011 APPRAISED VALUE - \$3,457,800

(BOE LOWERED TO \$3,164,000 IN 2010)

Anne Yon, Commissioner, **moved to approve lowering the 2011 appraised value of \$3,457,800 to \$3,000,000 for Parcel 98.1.** Nancy Cartmill, President, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous.

DISTRICT – 05, MAP – 20, PARCEL – 43

2010 APPRAISED VALUE - \$780,100

2011 APPRAISED VALUE - \$780,000

(BOE LOWERED TO \$631,000 IN 2010)

Anne Yon, Commissioner, **moved to approve lowering the 2011 appraised value of \$780,000 to \$600,000 for Parcel 43.** Nancy Cartmill, Commissioner, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

TUESDAY, FEBRUARY 15, 2011

PAGE ELEVEN

DISTRICT – 05, MAP – 20, PARCEL – 45

2010 APPRAISED VALUE - \$651,900

2011 APPRAISED VALUE - \$651,900

(BOE LOWERED TO \$570,200 IN 2010)

Anne Yon, Commissioner, **moved to approve lowering the 2011 appraised value of \$651,900 to 525,000 for Parcel 45.** Nancy Cartmill, President, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous.

DISTRICT – 05, MAP – 20, PARCEL – 91

2010 APPRAISED VALUE - \$126,300

2011 APPRAISED VALUE - \$126,300

(BOE LOWERED TO \$120,000 IN 2010)

Anne Yon, Commissioner, **moved to approve lowering the 2011 appraised value of \$126,300 to \$115,000 for Parcel 91.** Nancy Cartmill, President, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous.

DISTRICT – 05, MAP – 20, PARCEL – 210

2010 APPRAISED VALUE - \$2,400

2011 APPRAISED VALUE – 2,400

Anne Yon, Commissioner, **moved to approve leaving the 2011 appraised value of \$2,400 for Parcel 210.** Nancy Cartmill, President, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous.

PARKVIEW LIMITED PARTNERSHIP

DISTRICT – 07, MAP – 55, PARCEL – 346

2010 APPRAISED VALUE - \$2,833,100

2011 APPRAISED VALUE - \$2,773,800

**(PER JUDGE PANCAKE’S COURT ORDER; \$360,000
FOR 2010)**

Anne Yon, Commissioner, **moved to approve lowering the 2011 appraised value of \$2,773,800 to the Assessor's offer of \$1,500,000 for Parkview Limited.** Nancy Cartmill, President, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

TUESDAY, FEBRUARY 15, 2011

PAGE TWELVE

THE HAMLETS LIMITED PARTNERSHIP

DISTRICT – 04, MAP – 4, PARCEL – 1.2

2010 APPRAISED VALUE - \$2,896,000

2011 APPRAISED VALUE - \$2,836,700

(PER JUDGE PANCAKE'S COURT ORDER; \$390,000

FOR 2010)

Anne Yon, Commissioner, **moved to approve lowering the 2011 appraised value of \$2,836,700 to the Assessor's offer of \$1,750,000 for the The Hamlets.** Nancy Cartmill, President, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous.

PINE HAVEN LIMITED PARTNERSHIP

DISTRICT – 09, MAP – 10, PARCEL – 1.1

2010 APPRAISED VALUE - \$1,962,300

2011 APPRAISED VALUE - \$1,889,800

(PER JUDGE PANCAKE'S COURT ORDER; \$240,000

FOR 2010)

Anne Yon, Commissioner, **moved to approve lowering the 2011 appraised value of \$1,889,800 to the Assessor's offer of \$950,000 for Pine Haven.** Nancy Cartmill, President, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous.

Nancy Cartmill, President, recessed the Board of Equalization and Review at 11:05 a.m.

Nancy Cartmill, President, reconvened the meeting at 2:00 a.m., with Commissioner Anne Yon absent.

William Watson, County Attorney, was present for this part of the meeting.

2:00 P.M.

BILL BRESNAHAN, APPEARING FOR

BREOF BNK MIDWEST, LLC, 1000 5TH AVENUE,

HUNTINGTON

DISTRICIT – GIDEON, MAP – 18, PARCEL – 208

2010 APPRAISED VALUE - \$3,991,200

(3,000,000 COURT ORDERED)

2011 APPRAISED VALUE - #3,959,800

VALUE IN MR. BRESNAHAM'S OPINION-NO VALUE GIVEN

William Watson, County Attorney, swore in Robert K. Withers, Certified Appraiser and J.D. Adkins, Cabell County Assessor's Office.

Mr. Bresnahan, Attorney for Breof BNK Midwest, and Robert K. Withers appeared before the Board of Equalization and Review. Mr. Bresnahan asked Mr. Withers in his opinion what he believed the appraised value of the property would be and what method did he use to arrive at that value.

BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW

TUESDAY, FEBRUARY 15, 2011

PAGE THIRTEEN

Mr. Withers stated he had valued the property at \$1,706,000 by using the income approach. Mr. Withers went on to say the building which was only 85% occupied, was old and not properly laid out for an office building.

Mr. Bresnahan requested that Mr. Wither's appraisal report be entered into the record as Exhibit #1.

J.D. Adkins, Assessor's Office, informed the Board that he used the cost approach for the appraised value of the property. Mr. Adkins went on to say that he believed the appraisement was correct and comparable to other properties in the area.

Mr. Adkins provided documentation regarding other properties in the area and a building permit for property across the street from 1000 5th Avenue. Mr. Adkins requested the documents be entered into the record. Exhibits #1 through #3.

Nancy Cartmill, President, informed Mr. Bresnahan that he would be notified by mail of the Board's decision.

Robert L. Bailey, Commissioner, **moved to approve lowering the 2011 appraised value of \$3,959,800 to \$3,000,000, the 2010 court ordered appraised value, for the property located at 1000 5th Avenue, Huntington, Gideon District, Map 18 and Parcel 208.** Nancy Cartmill, President, seconded the motion and the vote was unanimous.

2:30 P.M. BILL RISKE, Esq - CANCELLED (PER AGREEMENT)

3:00 P.M. P. JEFFREY NORTH, Esq – CANCELLED

There being no further business before the Board of Equalization and Review, the meeting was adjourned Sine Die, at 3:25 p.m.

PRESIDENT, COUNTY COMMISSION

KSC:ar